

EURAXESS

OTM-R Checklist

Case number

2022IT838957

Name Organisation under review

UNIVERSITA' DEGLI STUDI DI URBINO CARLO BO

Organisation's contact details

VIA SAFFI,2, URBINO, 61029, Italy

Date endorsement charter and code

06/10/2022

Submission date to the European Commission

04/10/2023

Open, Transparent, and Merit-based Recruitment Check-list: OTM-R

A specific self-assessment checklist is provided for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment (OTM-R). Please report on the status of achievement, also detail on the indicators and the form of measurement used.

- The "Open", "Transparent" and "Merit-based" checkboxes are indicative of the type of policies and practices the questions refer to, as detailed in the C&C. They are pre-set in the HRS4R E-tool and cannot be changed. No action is needed from institutions in their respect.
- The difference between "+/- Yes substantially" and "-/+ Yes partially" ratings is that in the first case the volume of the remaining work to be done until completion is little as compared to the effort that has been put so far in that direction, whereas for "-/+ Yes partially", the remaining work is either the same in volume or more than what has been achieved.
- For the "Suggested indicators" column, whenever the user hovers the mouse in the row dedicated to each question, a small text box will pop up, indicating options of potential indicators to use. However, each institution should identify own measurements of the effectiveness of its OTM-R policy which should be further reviewed and adapted.

Open Transparent Meritbased Answer:

Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)

OTM-R system

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)?	x	x	x	-/+ Yes partially	There is no comprehensive document stating our general OTM-R policy. However, UniUrb complies with Italian National Law 240/2010, promoting OTM-R with explicit reference to the Charter & Code. Both UniUrb's Statute and internal regulations governing researchers' recruitment endorse and elaborate on OTM-R principles, ensuring their implementation in all recruitment procedures. All internal regulations are published on the section Statute and Regulations of UniUrb's institutional webpage (surf the left menu). Only the Associate and Full Professors' appointment regulation - Art. 1, § 1 refers explicitly to compliance with the Charter & Code. Moreover, the programmatic documents (i.e. University's Strategic Plan; Departments' Strategic Plans; Recruitment Plan) as well as the Fixed-term Researchers' appointment regulation, Regulation for the award of Research Fellowship, PhD regulation should be revised in order to include explicit references to the Charter & Code.
Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions?	x	x	x	+/- Yes substantially	All information about OTM-R procedures and practices is available in the regulations for recruitment of all types of position, published on UniUrb website: - Associate and Full Professors' appointment regulation - Fixed-term Researchers' appointment regulation - Regulation for the award of Research Fellowship - PhD regulation

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R?	x	x	x	+/- Yes substantially	Administrative staff involved in the OTM-R process (recruitment and selection of Associate and Full Professors, Researchers and Research Fellows, PhD students) attend upgrading and training courses managed by external companies; in addition, UniUrb has approved a new training plan (Piano integrato di attività e organizzazione – Annex 6, page 248) including courses about OTM-R. Research Staff Recruitment Office supports Selection Committees also by providing each committee member with an info pack summarizing the procedural steps. All researchers are informed about internal regulations governing recruitment procedures: these are approved by the academic bodies (Academic Senate and Administrative Board) and published both on the website (reporting also the date of the last update) and on the University's official register (Albo Ufficiale di Ateneo). Moreover, all personnel are informed via email when a new regulation or an updated version of an existing one is published.

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?	x	x		++ Yes completely	All recruitment procedures are mostly digitized. On-line procedures are in place for the submission of applications for all researcher positions: - All applications must be submitted online via the platform "PICA"; - For PhD positions, the selections take place exclusively online via Zoom. - Selections for other positions may take place both online and in presence. At the end of the procedure, the President of the Committee sends the final reports to the Research Staff Recruitment Office via registered email.

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?	x	x	x	++ Yes completely	<p>The low number of appeals compared to the high number of selection procedures managed in the last three years (only 3 appeals out of about 1895 applications, i.e. 0.16%) demonstrates the high quality of the OTM-R system. National legislation require Public Entities to nominate a Responsible for Transparency and for the Prevention of Corruption (RPCT) and an Internal Evaluation Committee (i.e. Nucleo di Valutazione Interna - NdV) in order to guarantee transparency and to prevent corruption in all procedures. Every year the National Authority for the Prevention of Corruption (ANAC) monitors the compliance to legislation on transparency, by requesting the NdV to state and demonstrate the correctness of the procedures. Moreover, in compliance with national legislation, UniUrb has appointed a Quality Assurance Committee (Presidio della Qualità di Ateneo) in charge of ensuring the implementation of the University's overall Quality Assurance Policy, by means of promoting a merit-based and high-quality culture; developing new instruments and methodologies to ensure high quality in research, teaching and knowledge transfer; supervising adequate and uniform implementation of the QA procedures. Finally, the Research Staff Recruitment Office supervises the whole recruitment process and makes sure that national legislation and internal regulations are applied. The performance of the administrative staff, including that of the Research Staff Recruitment Office, is yearly assessed as</p>

Open Transparent Meritbased Answer:

Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)

stated in the "Piano integrato di attività e organizzazione "(see page 33).

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	x	x	x	+/- Yes substantially	All positions are advertised widely and transparently through different channels (see below, section “Advertisement and Application Phase”). In compliance with National Law 240/2010 - Art. 18, § 4), the University binds at least one fifth of the open tenure track positions to external candidates (i.e. candidates who did not work/hold a research grant within UniUrb in the previous three years). Moreover, national legislation encourages recruitment of external staff through specific provisions and dedicated recruitment procedures. Call for applications are usually open for at least 1 month. The trend in the share of applicants from outside the organisation can be outlined as follows (considering applications received in the period 2020-2022): Full professor, external candidates: 2 out of 3 (66,67%) in 2020; 0 out of 1 (0%) in 2021; 11 out of 19 (57,89%) in 2022. Associate professor, external candidates: 30 out of 33 (90,91%) in 2020; 6 out of 6 (100%) in 2021; 21 out of 23 (91,30%) in 2022. Junior Fixed-term Researchers (Researchers under art. 24, para 3, letter a) of Italian Law 240/2010, so-called “RTD-a”), external applicants: 7 out of 9 (77,78%) in 2020; 15 out of 22 (68,18%) in 2021; 24 out of 40 (60%) in 2022. Senior Fixed-term Researchers (Researchers under art. 24, para 3, letter b) of Italian Law 240/2010, so-called “RTD-b”), external applicants: 12 out of 15 (80%) in 2020; 119 out of 138 (86,23%) in 2021; 46 out of 56 (82,14%) in 2022. Research fellowships, external applicants: 74 out of 95 (77,89%) in

Open Transparent Meritbased Answer:

Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)

2020; 112 out of 144 (77,78%) in 2021; 73 out of 98 (74,49%) in 2022. PhD, external applicants: 362 out of 394 (91,88%) in 2020; 398 out of 441 (90,25%) in 2021; 297 out of 358 (82,96%) in 2022.

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	x	x	x	-/+ Yes partially	In compliance with national legislation, researchers from abroad can apply for all the open positions for researchers. Moreover, UniUrb can directly recruit researchers from abroad through nominative proposals sent to the Ministry of University and Research - MUR (National Law 230/2005 article 1 §9). In particular, it is possible to appoint researchers who have been permanently engaged abroad in research or teaching activities for at least three years, holding an equivalent academic position in a foreign University or Research Institution. The call requires the consultation of the National Scientific Qualification Commissions (Abilitazione Scientifica Nazionale - ASN). Moreover, the recruitment of Italian researchers working abroad (so-called Rientro dei Cervelli) is encouraged by the same law, which ensures them tax breaks. In compliance with National Law 230/2005 - Art. 1, § 9, UniUrb planned the recruitment procedure for three R3 positions from abroad (two of them likely to be appointed in 2023). According to D.M. 919/2022, it is possible to appoint researchers who are Principal Investigators (PIs) of high-qualification research projects funded by the European Union or by the Italian Ministry of University and Research (MUR). Call for applications for Doctoral positions reserve 2 of the UniUrb-funded scholarships in each doctoral course to applicants with a foreign qualification (about 22.2%); moreover, non-EU candidates with international protection are exempt from paying the competition fee. In order to attract

researchers from abroad, all the open positions for R2-R4 are advertised in English in the Euraxess portal, although the extended version of the call for applications is published in Italian only. The trend in the share of applicants from abroad can be outlined as follows (considering applications received in the period 2020-2022): Full professor, foreign applicants: 1 out of 23 (4,35%) Associate professor, foreign applicants: 0 out of 62 (0%) Junior Fixed-term Researchers (Researchers under art. 24, para 3, letter a) of Italian Law 240/2010, so-called "RTD-a"), foreign applicants: 0 out of 9 (0%) in 2020; 2 out of 22 (9,09%) in 2021; 1 out of 40 (2,50%) in 2022. Senior Fixed-term Researchers (Researchers under art. 24, para 3, letter b) of Italian Law 240/2010, so-called "RTD-b"), foreign applicants: 0 out of 15 (0%) in 2020; 5 out of 138 (3,62%) in 2021; 3 out of 56 (5,36%) in 2022. Research fellowships, foreign applicants: 9 out of 95 (9,47%) in 2020; 13 out of 144 (9,03%) in 2021; 7 out of 98 (7,14%) in 2022. PhD, foreign applicants: 74 out of 394 (18,78%) in 2020 196 out of 441 (44,44%) in 2021; 103 out of 358 (28,77%) in 2022. Finally, UniUrb has internal policies to host Visiting Professors/Researchers from abroad by enhancing international mobility (Regulation conferring status of Visiting Professor, Visiting Researcher and for Outgoing Visiting Researchers) and encouraging joint-supervision agreements (co-tutelle) for PhD students, allowing them to obtain the double doctoral degree.

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups?	x	x	x	++ Yes completely	<p>UniUrb guarantees equality and equal opportunities for access to work and treatment at work: UniUrb's Code of Ethics rejects any form of discrimination, specifying that all members of the academic community have the right to be treated with equal respect and consideration regardless of their religion, gender, skin colour, ethnic or social origin, citizenship, etc. Furthermore, although selection criteria are based exclusively on scientific competences and publications, the University implements specific measures aiming at allowing the widest participation of disabled persons: - all documents concerning the selection process are published on the institutional web site in compliance with accessibility standards; - applicants with disabilities or Specific Learning Difficulties (SpLD) can request extra time and/or assistance and/or adequate support during the selection procedure (according to the Italian law n. 104/1992 and subsequent amendments and additions, and Law n. 170/2010). Under an economic point of view, PhD selection procedure provide that: 1) non-EU candidates with international protection are exempt from paying the competition fee; 2) PhD students with disabilities are totally exempt from paying the annual contribution and the regional tax for the right to study.</p>

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	x	x	x	++ Yes completely	<p>UniUrb provides all researchers with access to research funds, instruments, infrastructures and ICT facilities. With specific reference to infrastructures and scientific equipment, refurbishment and renovation work is currently underway. Furthermore, UniUrb provides researchers with opportunities for training and career advancement, including tools and services to learn about funding opportunities and to support technology transfer. Researchers, Research Fellows and PhD students have the right to health insurance for accidents and civil liability towards third parties, as required by national legislation. Moreover, UniUrb has implemented services for improving the quality of life of its staff, such as: - Centro Estivo Giovanissimi UniUrb “Valeria Solesin” (i.e., summer camp for all employees’ children); - Insieme (i.e., counselling service for all students and staff). R1 have specifically right to: - services provided by ERDIS Marche (i.e., bursaries, canteen, accommodation, etc.); - reserved study or work spaces within libraries and departmental structures; The University monitors the quality of life in the workplace through online surveys. The researchers’ satisfaction about administrative services (including infrastructure, equipment and workspaces) are annually investigated through a questionnaire drawn up in accordance with the Good Practice project; moreover, UniUrb is implementing a new questionnaire on organisational well-being to be addressed to all researchers</p>

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?				++ Yes completely	UniUrb ensures that the most suitable researchers apply by advertising its vacancies as widely as possible in order to reach the broadest possible audience and by adopting merit-based selection criteria.
Advertising and application phase					
Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	x	x		++ Yes completely	National legislation and internal regulations provide clear guidelines for advertising open positions: - Calls for applications for Full/Associate professors and Junior and Senior Fixed-Term Researchers are advertised on the "Gazzetta Ufficiale" (i.e., the Official Journal of Italy) and published on the section Concorsi in the University's institutional website, on the Ministry of University and Research website and on Euraxess; - Calls for applications for Research fellowships and Doctoral positions are published on the section Concorsi in the University's institutional website, on the Ministry of University and Research website and on Euraxess. Calls for applications are advertised following the standard templates provided by each portal, clearly indicating required/mandatory fields to fill in.

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit?	x	x		+/- Yes substantially	The calls for applications and job advertisements provide all the information relevant for the applicant for preparing the application [organization and recruiting unit; job title with specifications; researcher career profiles (R1-R4) with the respective 'required' and 'desirable' competencies; knowledge and professional experience (distinguishing the 'required' and 'desirable'); number of available positions; entitlements (salary, other benefits, etc.); type of contract; deadline], while the specific selection criteria and their respective weight are established by the appointed Selection Committee during their first meeting and immediately published. Although the adverts do not provide explicit links or information about equal opportunities policy, career development opportunities, working conditions and workplace, candidates can find this information in the institutional website.
Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?	x	x		+/- Yes substantially	According to National Law 240/2010, all researchers' recruitment adverts are published on EURAXESS. However, the full version of the calls for applications is available in English only for R1 positions. For what concerns other open positions, only the advertisement and a short description are available in English on EURAXESS, together with the link to the extended call for applications, published in Italian in the Ministry of University and Research (MUR) website and in the section Concorsi in the University's institutional website.

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Do we make use of other job advertising tools?	x	x		++ Yes completely	UniUrb commits to sponsor the calls for applications as much as possible. All recruitment calls are advertised on: - section Concorsi in the University's institutional website; - Ministry of University and Research (MUR) website; - "Gazzetta Ufficiale" Journal – R3/R4; - Euraxess; - PICA platform; - CRUI website (i.e. The Conference of Italian University Rectors), only for R2/R3/R4; - social networks (i.e. Instagram, Facebook, LinkedIn), only for R1.
Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate?	x			++ Yes completely	The administrative burden has been reduced to a minimum thanks to the use of e-recruitment procedures, via PICA platform. The supporting documentation is entirely managed through the online platform and the possibility of error in filling in the application is very low. No paper or stamps are required. In their initial application, candidates do not have to provide original or translated certificates related to qualifications they declare to possess; only successful candidates have to provide the original documents at the very end of the procedure. Concerning publications, PICA allows to import the candidate's publications from the database of the Ministry of University and Research storing the publications of all Italian researchers (Loginmiur)
Selection and evaluation phase					

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees?		x	x	++ Yes completely	UniUrb's internal regulations and the calls for applications establish clear rules governing the appointment of Selection Committees; Committee members are appointed by Rectoral Decree according to the proposal of the Department Council. - Associate and Full Professors' appointment regulation - Art. 6; - Fixed-term Researchers' appointment regulation - Art 7; - Regulation for the award of Research Fellowship - Art. 12; - PhD regulation - Art. 16.

Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?	x	x	++ Yes completely	<p>Committees are clearly appointed according to national legislation, University's internal regulations and calls for applications. Each Committee is composed of a minimum of 3 members. When proposing the Selection Committee members, the Department ensures the respect of ANVUR (Italian national agency for the evaluation of universities and research institutes)'s requirements for R2, R3 and R4: relevant experience, qualifications and competencies to assess the candidate. For R4 at least two members have to be external/international experts. However, UniUrb's regulations guarantee the inclusion of external experts in all committees for R2, R3 and R4.</p> <p>Concerning R1's selection procedures, Selection committees can be composed of external experts, including foreign experts; experts chosen from public and private research bodies and structures can be added; the appointment of these experts is mandatory in the case of courses activated in agreement with companies. In compliance with National Law 240/2010 - Art. 6, §§ 7 and 8, researchers whose teaching and research activity is negatively evaluated, according to the criteria established by ANVUR (National Agency for the Assessment of University and Research), cannot be appointed as members of Selection Committees. Each member of the Committee declares that there is no conflict of interest among themselves and between them and the candidates.</p>

	Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?		x	x	+/- Yes substantially	According to national legislation and internal regulations, at least one third of the Selection Committee should come from the less-represented gender. If the percentage of one third is not accomplished, it has to be motivated by the Department. However, the Associate and Full Professors' appointment regulation, the Regulation for the award of Research Fellowship and the PhD regulation do not specify explicit obligations about gender balance.
Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate being selected?			x	+/- Yes substantially	Selection Committees have the competences to choose the best candidate; they operate according to an evidence-based procedure. Calls for applications explicitly specify general selection criteria (both "required" and "desirable"), while their respective weight is established by the appointed selection committee during their first meeting and before the evaluation process starts. Selection criteria are based on merit both in a quantitative and qualitative way (funding, publications, impact of the research, technology transfer, management, mobility, soft skills, seniority, etc.). The Selection Committee reflects these criteria in their reports.
Appointment phase					

Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?	x		+/- Yes substantially	<p>All applicants can consult all the relevant documents related to the selection procedure on the University's institutional website, section Concorsi, as the selection process proceeds, as specified in the call for applications. The relevant documents published online are: - R1/R4: appointed Selection Committee, selection criteria; shortlisted candidates; final merit ranking including the name of the successful candidate; - only for R1: qualifications' evaluation score and interview score. For R1, admitted and eligible candidates are directly contacted. The unsuitable candidates are not notified and are not included in the final ranking. If excluded before the selection (i.e., for lack of requirements), the candidate is informed via registered mail or certified e-mail.</p>
Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?	x		-/+ Yes partially	<p>All applicants can consult selection criteria and the final merit ranking, including the name of the successful candidate, on the website. For R1/R2 the preliminary score, based on the qualifications' assessment, is also published online; only for R1 candidates, the interview scores are published (see above, item 20). However, the extended evaluations of individual candidates (e.g. strengths and weaknesses of the application etc.) are not published online. Nonetheless, each candidate can submit a request for access to minutes.</p>

Open	Transparent	Meritbased	Answer:	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?	x		+/- Yes substantially	<p>In compliance with the national legislation, it is possible to appeal to the regional administrative court or to appeal to the President of the Republic. Moreover, two additional types of internal complaint procedures are in place: - complaints to the Rector and to the Unique Responsible for the Procedure (RUP); - jurisdictional and administrative appeals. However, the procedure to deal with complaints is not declared explicitly, except for R1 selection procedures, reporting the process of how to access minutes at the bottom of each call for applications. In addition, our whistleblowing system can be extended to all people who want to report "maladministration". In the last three years, Uniurb has recorded only 3 appeals out of about 1895 applications (0.16%).</p>
Overall assessment				
Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives?			+/- Yes substantially	<p>Each recruitment procedure is monitored by a Unique Responsible for the Procedure (RUP), who is in charge of verifying whether the procedure in place is actually open, transparent and merit-based. Although a regular audit system is not fully implemented under the quality check system, the effectiveness of this monitoring system is demonstrated by the low number of complaints compared to the high number of selection procedures, regularly published on the "Amministrazione trasparente" section of the institutional website.</p>